



Guidelines for Evaluating WILLA Entries in the Young Adult Category

The purpose of Women Writing the West[®] is to become the internationally recognized organization of writers and other professionals engaged in writing and promoting writing about the North American West with emphasis on the experiences and sensibilities of women in that region. The WILLA Literary Awards are presented annually for outstanding literature featuring women's or girls' stories set in the North American West and includes Alaska and Hawaii.

Entries in the Young Adult Category can range from young adult books with mature themes to picture books and graphic novels; from fiction to nonfiction to poetry. The following rubrics were developed to help readers evaluate such diverse entries. They are intended to be guidelines only. Readers should use their own judgement in assessing how well each entry suits its target audience.

Points should be awarded as follows:

- 10 – exceptional in all regards
- 9 – excellent
- 8 – well done
- 7 – majority well done; room for polish
- 6 – good overall with strong points
- 5 – good overall
- 4 – good overall with some weak points
- 3 – good start but needs work
- 2 – good idea but poor presentation
- 1 – needs work throughout
- 0 – ineligible

Note that entries that do not warrant at least 4 points in the first benchmark, “Women of the West Theme,” should be disqualified.

WILLA CATEGORY RUBRIC YOUNG ADULT FICTION[©]

Fiction	Ineligible	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
1. Women of the West Theme	<input type="checkbox"/> Male main character(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Book not set in the West* <input type="checkbox"/> Does not portray authentic western experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content do not reflect WWW’s mission & goals	<input type="checkbox"/> Female characters prominent <input type="checkbox"/> Book set in the West but could have happened anywhere; or, book partly set in the West* <input type="checkbox"/> Generally portrays authentic experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content generally reflect WWW’s mission & goals	<input type="checkbox"/> Female main character(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Western setting primary & essential* <input type="checkbox"/> Consistently portrays authentic western experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content excellent reflections of WWW’s mission & goals
	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
2. Characterization	<input type="checkbox"/> Characters not well developed <input type="checkbox"/> Stereotypical character(s)** <input type="checkbox"/> Dialogue not convincing <input type="checkbox"/> Characters indistinct from those in similar books <input type="checkbox"/> Didactic, preachy	<input type="checkbox"/> Most characters complex <input type="checkbox"/> Generally no gender, ethnic, racial, or other stereotypes** <input type="checkbox"/> Dialogue at times sounds unnatural <input type="checkbox"/> Characters similar to others within the genre, but well developed <input type="checkbox"/> Character’s “lesson” generally well presented	<input type="checkbox"/> All characters complex, well developed <input type="checkbox"/> No gender, ethnic, racial, or other stereotypes included** <input type="checkbox"/> Dialogue sounds natural <input type="checkbox"/> Characters distinct, original <input type="checkbox"/> Any “lesson” subtle & organic
3. Setting	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting not important to the book <input type="checkbox"/> Setting not described	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting of moderate importance <input type="checkbox"/> Setting described in conventional terms	<input type="checkbox"/> A strong sense of place is inherent in book <input type="checkbox"/> Setting vividly described, using all senses



Fiction	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
4. Plot	<input type="checkbox"/> Plot confusing <input type="checkbox"/> Subplots (if used) sporadic, or not well balanced with main plot, or left unresolved <input type="checkbox"/> Book fails to hook readers; ending not satisfying <input type="checkbox"/> Implausible <input type="checkbox"/> Plot predictable	<input type="checkbox"/> Plot moderately well developed <input type="checkbox"/> Subplots (if used) not always balanced or well resolved <input type="checkbox"/> Slow beginning leads to more action; or conclusion leaves some questions unanswered; or conclusion is not satisfying <input type="checkbox"/> Some points may strain credibility <input type="checkbox"/> Plot not new, but shows some freshness	<input type="checkbox"/> Plot well developed <input type="checkbox"/> Subplots (if used) well integrated & resolved <input type="checkbox"/> Opening draws reader in; conclusion satisfying <input type="checkbox"/> Suspension of disbelief consistent <input type="checkbox"/> Plot original, fresh
5. Voice	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice lacking, confusing, distances readers from the story <input type="checkbox"/> Point of view confusing	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice dependable <input type="checkbox"/> Point of view wavers, or occasionally jumps	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice engaging, fresh, distinct <input type="checkbox"/> Point of view clear, consistent; or POV shifts clear & intentional
6. Literary Qualities	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor or inappropriate command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) <input type="checkbox"/> Imagery confusing or nonexistent <input type="checkbox"/> Premise conventional, simplistic, expected <input type="checkbox"/> Book not suited for intended audience, unappealing <input type="checkbox"/> Not enjoyable or thought-provoking	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) <input type="checkbox"/> Imagery clear <input type="checkbox"/> Premise not new, but well explored <input type="checkbox"/> Book generally suited to the intended audience, moderately appealing <input type="checkbox"/> A pleasant read	<input type="checkbox"/> Consistently strong command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) <input type="checkbox"/> Imagery vivid, fresh <input type="checkbox"/> Premise breaks new ground <input type="checkbox"/> Well suited to intended audience, appealing <input type="checkbox"/> Thought-provoking



Fiction	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
7. Technical Conventions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary inappropriate for target audience <input type="checkbox"/> Frequent problems with grammar, punctuation, spelling <input type="checkbox"/> Sloppy, wordy, repetitious writing <input type="checkbox"/> Poor balance between dialogue & narrative 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary appropriate for target audience <input type="checkbox"/> Occasional lapses of grammar, punctuation, spelling <input type="checkbox"/> Clear writing <input type="checkbox"/> Adequate balance between dialogue & narrative 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary excellent for target audience <input type="checkbox"/> Clear grasp of grammar, punctuation, spelling; or reader trusts that conventions purposefully set aside <input type="checkbox"/> Tight writing <input type="checkbox"/> Good balance between dialogue & narrative
8. Presentation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Unattractive cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features lacking <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting difficult to read <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) of poor quality, or irrelevant to text 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Adequate cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features adequate <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting adequate <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) of moderate clarity, or not always germane to the text 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Attractive, appropriate, compelling cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features reflect book's tone <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting clear <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) appropriate, clear <input type="checkbox"/> Properly bound, i.e., audio books and eBooks

* WWW defines “the West” as all of North America west of the Mississippi River, and includes Alaska and Hawaii.

** Depiction of a character’s biases or stereotypical views, presented in context, may be appropriate.



WILLA CATEGORY RUBRIC YOUNG ADULT NONFICTION[©]

Nonfiction	Ineligible	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
1. Women of the West Theme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Male main character(s); no relevant theme <input type="checkbox"/> Book not set in or pertains to the West* <input type="checkbox"/> Does not portray authentic western experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content do not reflect WWW’s mission & goals <input type="checkbox"/> Little or no educational merit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> At least half of the characters female; relevant theme <input type="checkbox"/> Book set in the West but could have happened anywhere; or, book partly set in the West* <input type="checkbox"/> Generally portrays authentic western experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content generally well-reflect WWW’s mission & goals <input type="checkbox"/> Moderate educational merit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Female main character(s), relevant theme <input type="checkbox"/> Western setting primary & essential* <input type="checkbox"/> Consistently portrays authentic western experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content excellent reflections of WWW’s mission & goals <input type="checkbox"/> Excellent educational merit
	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
2. Characterization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Depictions of people not well developed, or depiction not appropriate for target audience <input type="checkbox"/> Stereotypes evident** <input type="checkbox"/> People portrayed of little interest to a young adult 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Somewhat complex depictions of people (as appropriate for target audience) <input type="checkbox"/> Generally no gender, ethnic, racial, or other stereotypes presented** <input type="checkbox"/> People portrayed of some interest to a young adult 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complex depictions of people (as appropriate for target audience) <input type="checkbox"/> No gender, ethnic, racial, or other stereotypes included** <input type="checkbox"/> People portrayed of strong interest to a young adult
3. Setting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Setting not important <input type="checkbox"/> Setting not described, or described poorly <input type="checkbox"/> Setting not described accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) rarely complement or match text 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Setting of moderate importance <input type="checkbox"/> Setting described in conventional terms <input type="checkbox"/> Setting usually described accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) usually complement or match text 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> A sense of place is inherent in the book <input type="checkbox"/> Setting vividly described, using all senses <input type="checkbox"/> Setting described accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) consistently complement or match text



Nonfiction	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10
4. Narrative	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor presentation of facts, concepts, or ideas <input type="checkbox"/> Premise or subject predictable, or poorly considered <input type="checkbox"/> Narrative poorly developed <input type="checkbox"/> Beginning slow, confusing; conclusion not satisfying <input type="checkbox"/> Topic or theme of little interest to a young adult	<input type="checkbox"/> Fair presentation of facts, concepts, or ideas <input type="checkbox"/> Premise or subject not new, but well done <input type="checkbox"/> Narrative moderately well developed <input type="checkbox"/> Slow beginning leads to more action; conclusion somewhat satisfying <input type="checkbox"/> Topic or theme of some interest to a young adult	<input type="checkbox"/> Excellent presentation of facts, concepts, or ideas <input type="checkbox"/> Premise or subject shows originality, freshness <input type="checkbox"/> Narrative very well developed <input type="checkbox"/> Opening draws reader in; ending is satisfying <input type="checkbox"/> Topic or theme of strong interest to a young adult
5. Voice	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice lacking, confusing <input type="checkbox"/> Quotations (if used) poorly integrated	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice dependable <input type="checkbox"/> Quotations (if used) generally well integrated	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice engaging, fresh, distinct <input type="checkbox"/> Quotations (if used) effectively integrated
6. Literary Qualities	<input type="checkbox"/> Clumsy language <input type="checkbox"/> Imagery confusing <input type="checkbox"/> Text & illustrations (if used) not well matched <input type="checkbox"/> Not enjoyable or thought-provoking	<input type="checkbox"/> Smooth language <input type="checkbox"/> Imagery clear <input type="checkbox"/> Text & illustrations (if used) generally well matched <input type="checkbox"/> A pleasant read	<input type="checkbox"/> Clear command of language <input type="checkbox"/> Imagery vivid, fresh <input type="checkbox"/> Text & illustrations (if used) create a single whole <input type="checkbox"/> Enjoyable, thought-provoking



Nonfiction	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
7. Technical Conventions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Book difficult to follow; poorly organized <input type="checkbox"/> Writing too wordy, or includes extraneous material <input type="checkbox"/> Poor grasp of basic conventions of grammar, punctuation, etc. <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, vocabulary, sentence length inappropriate for target audience <input type="checkbox"/> Citations (if used) confusing, incomplete; or citations needed*** 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Book generally readable; moderately well organized <input type="checkbox"/> Writing generally tight, with some redundancies or extraneous material <input type="checkbox"/> Good grasp of basic conventions of grammar, punctuation, etc. <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, vocabulary, sentence length generally well suited for target audience <input type="checkbox"/> Citations (if used) generally good*** 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Book consistently easily readable, flows well; well organized <input type="checkbox"/> Writing tight <input type="checkbox"/> Clear command of basic conventions of grammar, punctuation, etc. <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, vocabulary, sentence length carefully chosen for target audience <input type="checkbox"/> Citations (if used) clear, effective***
8. Presentation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Unattractive cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features lacking <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting difficult to read <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) of poor quality, or irrelevant to text <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) not well balanced or matched with text 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Adequate cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features adequate <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting adequate <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) of moderate clarity, mostly identified; may not always be germane to the text <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) provide good balance with text 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Attractive, appropriate, compelling cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features reflect book's tone <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting clear & well chosen <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) appropriate, clear, identified <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) provide excellent balance with text <input type="checkbox"/> Properly bound, i.e., audio books and eBooks

* WWW defines “the West” as all of North America west of the Mississippi River, and includes Alaska and Hawaii.

** An author’s depiction of a real individual’s biases or stereotypical views, presented in context, may be appropriate.

*** Citations might include endnotes, an author’s note, glossary, suggested bibliography, or other supplemental information.



Copyright © 2006-2022 Women Writing the West® All rights reserved.

This rubric was created by and for Women Writing the West®, October 2006. Revised July 2022.

www.WomenWritingtheWest.org

WILLA CATEGORY RUBRIC

YOUNG ADULT PICTURE BOOKS AND GRAPHIC NOVELS[©]

Note: If a picture book is chosen as a WILLA Winner or Finalist, both author and illustrator will be honored

Picture Book	Ineligible	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
1. Women of the West Theme	<input type="checkbox"/> Male main character(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Book not set in, or pertain to, the West* <input type="checkbox"/> Does not portray authentic western experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content do not reflect WWW’s mission & goals	<input type="checkbox"/> Female characters prominent <input type="checkbox"/> Book set in the West but could have happened anywhere; or, book partly set in the West* <input type="checkbox"/> Generally portrays authentic experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content generally reflect WWW’s mission & goals	<input type="checkbox"/> Female main character(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Western setting primary & essential* <input type="checkbox"/> Consistently portrays authentic western experience <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content excellent reflections of WWW’s mission & goals
	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
2. Characterization	<input type="checkbox"/> Character(s) not well developed, not engaging <input type="checkbox"/> Does not engage readers in a young adult or young adult-friendly experience <input type="checkbox"/> Inappropriate number of characters <input type="checkbox"/> Didactic, preachy	<input type="checkbox"/> Character(s) moderately well developed, of some interest <input type="checkbox"/> Moderately engages reader in a young adult or young adult-friendly experience <input type="checkbox"/> Reader can generally differentiate among characters <input type="checkbox"/> Character’s “lesson” generally well presented	<input type="checkbox"/> Character(s) well developed, engaging <input type="checkbox"/> Thoroughly engages reader in a young adult or young adult-friendly experience <input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate number of characters <input type="checkbox"/> Any “lesson” subtle & organic
3. Setting	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting not cohesive with story <input type="checkbox"/> Setting not portrayed accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Text & illustrations inconsistent	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting of moderate importance to story <input type="checkbox"/> Setting generally portrayed accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations generally complement or support text	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting supports story <input type="checkbox"/> Setting consistently portrayed accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations consistently complement or support text



Picture Book	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
4 Plot	<input type="checkbox"/> Plot nonexistent, confusing <input type="checkbox"/> Main character does not solve problem <input type="checkbox"/> No solution <input type="checkbox"/> Resolution leaves no hope, unacceptable to young adult or adult reader	<input type="checkbox"/> Plot weak, has holes <input type="checkbox"/> Main character depends on others to solve problem <input type="checkbox"/> Solution predictable <input type="checkbox"/> Resolution provides some hope, acceptable to both young adult & adult reader	<input type="checkbox"/> Plot well crafted, comes full circle <input type="checkbox"/> Main character solves problem <input type="checkbox"/> Solution fresh & surprising <input type="checkbox"/> Resolution hopeful, satisfying for both young adult & adult reader
5 Voice	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice lacking <input type="checkbox"/> Point of view confusing <input type="checkbox"/> Difficult to read aloud <input type="checkbox"/> Rhyme (if used) forced or inconsistent <input type="checkbox"/> Story unlikely to be read more than once	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice dependable <input type="checkbox"/> Point of view adequate; occasional wavers <input type="checkbox"/> Generally good to read aloud; some lapses in rhythm or language <input type="checkbox"/> Rhyme (if used) usually good <input type="checkbox"/> Story somewhat likely to resonate during multiple readings	<input type="checkbox"/> Narrative voice fresh, engaging, distinct <input type="checkbox"/> Point of view appropriate for story & intended audience <input type="checkbox"/> Rhyme (if used) excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Story likely to resonate during multiple readings
6 Literary Qualities	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor or inappropriate command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) <input type="checkbox"/> Premise conventional, expected <input type="checkbox"/> Content not appropriate or appealing for intended audience	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) <input type="checkbox"/> Premise not new, but well explored <input type="checkbox"/> Content likely to appeal to some of intended audience	<input type="checkbox"/> Consistently strong command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) <input type="checkbox"/> Premise breaks new ground <input type="checkbox"/> Content likely to greatly appeal to intended audience



Picture Book	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
7 Technical Conventions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary inappropriate for target age group <input type="checkbox"/> Frequent problems with grammar, punctuation, spelling <input type="checkbox"/> Dialogue poorly written or unbalanced 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary generally appropriate for target age group <input type="checkbox"/> Grammar, punctuation, spellings generally good <input type="checkbox"/> Dialogue adequate 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary excellent for target age group <input type="checkbox"/> Clear grasp of grammar, punctuation, spelling <input type="checkbox"/> Dialogue appropriate, believable, incorporated well
8 Presentation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations inadequate, unpleasing <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations irrelevant to story <input type="checkbox"/> Unattractive cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features lacking <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting difficult to read, not used to support story <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations have no educational merit (if book appropriate or intended for classroom use) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations adequate, moderately well executed, pleasing <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations generally support story <input type="checkbox"/> Adequate cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Design features offer moderate story support, or not always germane to text <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting used adequately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations have some educational merit (if book appropriate or intended for classroom use) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations appropriate, well executed, engaging <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations effectively help tell the story <input type="checkbox"/> Attractive, appropriate, compelling art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Excellent design features support story <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting used effectively <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations enhance book’s educational merit (if book appropriate or intended for classroom use) <input type="checkbox"/> Properly bound, i.e., audio and eBooks

* WWW defines “the West” as all of North America west of the Mississippi River, and includes Alaska and Hawaii.



WILLA CATEGORY RUBRIC YOUNG ADULT POETRY[©]

Note: If a poetry anthology is chosen as a WILLA Winner or Finalist, the compiler will be honored

Poetry Collection	Ineligible	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
1. Women of the West Theme	<input type="checkbox"/> Male main character(s), no relevant theme in most poems <input type="checkbox"/> Western landscape (natural or human-made) nonexistent or irrelevant* <input type="checkbox"/> Poems do not portray authentic western experiences <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content of most poems do not reflect WWW's mission & goals	<input type="checkbox"/> Female character(s), relevant theme in most poems <input type="checkbox"/> Western landscape (natural or human-made) somewhat important* <input type="checkbox"/> Most poems portray authentic western experiences <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content of most poems reflect WWW's mission & goals	<input type="checkbox"/> Female main character(s), relevant theme consistent <input type="checkbox"/> Western landscape (natural or human-made) primary & essential* <input type="checkbox"/> Poems consistently portray authentic western experiences <input type="checkbox"/> Theme & content of all poems excellent reflections of WWW's mission & goals
	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
2. Characterization	<input type="checkbox"/> People/characters not well developed, or not appropriate for young readers <input type="checkbox"/> Stereotypes evident in many or all poems**	<input type="checkbox"/> People/characters generally well developed & appropriate for young readers <input type="checkbox"/> Most poems convey no gender, ethnic, racial, or other stereotypes**	<input type="checkbox"/> All people/characters believable & appropriate for young readers <input type="checkbox"/> No gender, ethnic, racial, or other stereotypes presented**
3. Setting	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting not important <input type="checkbox"/> Setting not portrayed accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) & text inconsistent	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting of moderate importance <input type="checkbox"/> Setting generally portrayed accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) & text generally matched	<input type="checkbox"/> Setting supports book's theme <input type="checkbox"/> Setting consistently portrayed accurately <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) & text well matched



Poetry Collection	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
4. Content, Ideas, Organization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Subject matter not likely to emotionally engage young readers <input type="checkbox"/> Poems not organized by theme or topic <input type="checkbox"/> Most poems inadequately depict an idea, experience, or emotion <input type="checkbox"/> Little evidence of logical or effective order or sequence 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Subject matter somewhat emotionally engaging for young readers <input type="checkbox"/> Adequate focus on overall theme or topic <input type="checkbox"/> Most poems depict an idea, experience, or emotion; some poems stronger than others <input type="checkbox"/> Poems moderately well arranged in logical & effective order, with workable flow from one to the next 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Subject matter emotionally engaging for young readers <input type="checkbox"/> Excellent, cohesive focus on overall theme or topic <input type="checkbox"/> Each poem depicts an idea, experience, or emotion <input type="checkbox"/> Poems consistently arranged in logical & effective order, with excellent flow from one to the next
5. Voice	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Little or no sense of poet's/poets' individual style(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Word choice rarely reflects or evokes poems' themes, sounds, or emotions <input type="checkbox"/> Difficult to read aloud <input type="checkbox"/> Poems unlikely to be read more than once 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Poet's/poets' individual style(s) sometimes apparent <input type="checkbox"/> Word choice sometimes reflects or evokes poems' themes, sounds, or emotions <input type="checkbox"/> Rhythm creates adequate “read-aloud” quality; some lapses <input type="checkbox"/> Some poems likely to resonate during multiple readings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Poet's/poets' individual style(s) clearly apparent <input type="checkbox"/> Word choice often reflects or evokes poems' themes, sounds, or emotions <input type="checkbox"/> Inherent rhythm creates excellent “read-aloud” quality <input type="checkbox"/> Poems likely to resonate during multiple readings
6. Literary Qualities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Poor or inappropriate command of language <input type="checkbox"/> Imagery abstract or clichéd <input type="checkbox"/> Rhyme (if used) forced or incomplete <input type="checkbox"/> Little or no demonstrated grasp of poetic conventions & devices 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Generally good command of language <input type="checkbox"/> Some use of concrete, fresh imagery <input type="checkbox"/> Rhyme (if used) generally good <input type="checkbox"/> Adequate grasp of poetic conventions & devices 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Consistently strong command of language <input type="checkbox"/> Consistently concrete, fresh imagery <input type="checkbox"/> Rhyme (if used) consistently excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Clear grasp of poetic conventions & devices



Poetry Collection	0 – 3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
7. Technical Conventions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Frequent problems with grammar, punctuation, spelling <input type="checkbox"/> Line breaks & poems' shapes confusing <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary inappropriate for target audience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Grammar, punctuation, spelling generally good <input type="checkbox"/> Line breaks & poems' shapes adequate <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary appropriate for target audience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Grammar, punctuation, spelling consistently good; unique constructions clearly intentional & effective <input type="checkbox"/> Line breaks & poems' shapes carefully considered <input type="checkbox"/> Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary excellent for target age group
8. Presentation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) inadequate, unpleasing <input type="checkbox"/> Unattractive cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Interior design features lacking <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting difficult to read; not used to support collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) adequate, pleasing <input type="checkbox"/> Adequate cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Design features moderately support collection <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting used adequately 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Illustrations (if used) appropriate, well executed, engaging <input type="checkbox"/> Attractive, appropriate, compelling cover art & design <input type="checkbox"/> Excellent design features support collection <input type="checkbox"/> Font & typesetting used effectively <input type="checkbox"/> Properly bound, i.e., audio and eBook

* WWW defines “the West” as all of North America west of the Mississippi River, and includes Alaska and Hawaii.

** Depiction of peoples' biases or stereotypical views, presented in context, may be appropriate.

