

2008 WILLA CATEGORY RUBRIC
CHILDREN'S/YA – PICTURE BOOKS

Note: If a picture book is chosen as a WILLA winner or finalist, both author and illustrator will be honored.

Picture Book	Ineligible	4-7 points	8-10 points
1. Women of the West Theme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Male main character(s) • Book not set in, or pertain to, the West* • Does not portray authentic western experience • Theme & content do not reflect WWW's mission & goals 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Female character(s) prominent • Book set in the West but could have happened anywhere; or, book partly set in the west* • Generally portrays authentic western experience • Theme & content generally reflect WWW's mission & goals 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Female main character(s) • Western setting primary & essential* • Consistently portrays authentic western experience • Theme & content excellent reflections of WWW's mission & goals
	0-3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
2. Characterization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Character(s) not well developed, not engaging • Does not engage readers in a child's or child-friendly experience • Characters not believable, or not appropriate for young readers • Inappropriate number of characters • Didactic, preachy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Character(s) moderately well developed, of some interest • Moderately engages reader in a child's or child-friendly experience • Most characters believable, appropriate for young readers • Reader can generally differentiate among characters • Character's "lesson" generally well presented 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Character(s) well developed, engaging • Thoroughly engages reader in a child's or child-friendly experience • All characters believable, appropriate for young readers • Appropriate number of characters • Any "lesson" subtle & organic

	0-3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
3. Setting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Setting not cohesive with story • Setting not portrayed accurately • Text & illustrations inconsistent 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Setting of moderate importance to story • Setting generally portrayed accurately • Illustrations generally complement or support text 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Setting supports story • Setting consistently portrayed accurately • Illustrations consistently complement or support text
4. Plot	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plot non-existent, confusing • Main character does not solve problem • No solution • Resolution leaves no hope, unacceptable to child or adult reader 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plot weak, has holes • Main character depends on others to solve problem • Solution predictable • Resolution provides some hope, acceptable to both child & adult reader 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plot well crafted, comes full-circle • Main character solves problem • Solution fresh & surprising • Resolution hopeful, satisfying for both child & adult reader
5. Voice	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Narrative voice lacking • Point of view confusing • Difficult to read aloud • Rhyme (if used) forced or inconsistent • Story unlikely to be read more than once 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Narrative voice dependable • Point of view adequate; occasional wavers • Generally good to read aloud; some lapses in rhythm or language • Rhyme (if used) usually good • Story somewhat likely to resonate during multiple readings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Narrative voice fresh, engaging, distinct • Point of view appropriate for story & intended audience • Excellent “read-aloud” quality • Rhyme (if used) excellent • Story likely to resonate during multiple readings

	0-3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
6. Literary Qualities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor or inappropriate command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) • Premise conventional, expected • Content not appropriate or appealing for intended audience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Moderate command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) • Premise not new, but well explored • Content likely to appeal to some of intended audience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consistently strong command of language (slang, word choice, figurative language, etc.) • Premise breaks new ground • Content likely to greatly appeal to intended audience
7. Technical Conventions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary inappropriate for target age group • Frequent problems with grammar, punctuation, spelling • Dialogue poorly written or unbalanced 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary generally appropriate for target age group • Grammar, punctuation, spelling generally good • Dialogue adequate 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Word count, sentence structure, vocabulary excellent for target age group • Clear grasp of grammar, punctuation, spelling • Dialogue appropriate, believable, incorporated well

	0-3 points	4 – 7 points	8 – 10 points
8. Presentation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Illustrations inadequate, unpleasing • Illustrations irrelevant to story • Unattractive cover art & design • Interior design features lacking • Font & typesetting difficult to read, not used to support story • Illustrations have no educational merit (if book appropriate or intended for classroom use) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Illustrations adequate, moderately well executed, pleasing • Illustrations generally support story • Adequate cover art & design • Design features offer moderate story support, or not always germane to text • Font & typesetting used adequately • Illustrations have some educational merit (if book appropriate or intended for classroom use) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Illustrations appropriate, well executed, engaging • Illustrations effectively help tell the story • Attractive, appropriate, compelling cover art & design • Excellent design features support story • Font & typesetting used effectively • Illustrations enhance book's educational merit (if book appropriate or intended for classroom use)

* WWW defines “the West” as all of North America west of the Mississippi River.

This rubric was created by and for Women Writing the West, October, 2006.